

Berakhot 28a

תָּנָא אוֹתוֹ הַיּוֹם, סִלְקוּהוּ לְשׁוּמְרֵי הַפֶּתַח וְנִתְּנָה לְהֵם רְשׁוּת
לְתַלְמִידִים לִיכְנֹס. שְׁהֵיהּ רַבֵּן גַּמְלִיאֵל מְכַרִּיז וְאוֹמֵר: לְתַלְמִיד
שְׂאִין תּוֹכוֹ כְּבָרוּ, לֹא יִכְנֹס לְבֵית הַמְּדַרְשׁ.

It was taught: On that day that they removed Rabban Gamliel from his position and appointed Rabbi Elazar ben Azarya in his place, there was also a fundamental change in the general approach of the study hall as **they dismissed the guard at the door and permission was granted to the students to enter.** Instead of Rabban Gamliel's selective approach that asserted that the students must be screened before accepting them into the study hall, the new approach asserted that anyone who seeks to study should be given opportunity to do so. **As Rabban Gamliel would proclaim and say: Any student whose inside, his thoughts and feelings, are not like his outside, i.e., his conduct and his character traits are lacking, will not enter the study hall.**

הָהוּא יוֹמָא יוֹמָא אֲתוּסְפּוּ כַּמָּה סְפָסְלִי. אָמַר רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן: פְּלִיגִי בֵּה אַבָּא
יוֹסֵף בֶּן דּוֹסְתַי וְרַבָּנָן. חַד אָמַר: אֲתוּסְפּוּ אַרְבַּע מָאָה סְפָסְלִי. וְחַד
אָמַר: שִׁבְעַת מָאָה סְפָסְלִי. הָוָה קָא חֲלָשָׁה דְעֵתִיָּה דְרַבָּן גַּמְלִיאֵל,
אָמַר: דְלָמָּא חֵס וְשְׁלוֹם מְנַעַתִּי תוֹרָה מִיִּשְׂרָאֵל. אַחֲזוּ לִיה
בְּחַלְמִיָּה חֲצָבִי חִיּוּרֵי דְמַלְיִין קִטְמָא. וְלֹא הִיא, הָהִיא לִיתוּבִי
דְעֵתִיָּה, הוּא דְאַחֲזוּ לִיה.

The Gemara relates: **On that day several benches were added** to the study hall to accommodate the numerous students. **Rabbi Yoḥanan said: Abba Yosef ben Dostai and the Rabbis disputed this matter. One said: Four hundred benches were added** to the study hall. **And one said: Seven hundred benches were added** to the study hall. When he saw the tremendous growth in the number of students, **Rabban Gamliel was overcome with despair. He said: Perhaps, Heaven forbid, I prevented Israel from engaging in Torah study.**

They showed him in his dream white jugs filled with ashes alluding to the fact that the additional students were worthless idlers. The Gemara comments: **That is not** the case, but **that dream was shown to him to ease his mind** so that he would not feel bad.

תָּנָא: עֵדוּת בּוּ בַּיּוֹם נִשְׁנִית. וְ לַ הֵיכָא דְאִמְרִינָן "בּוּ בַּיּוֹם", הֵהוּא יוֹמָא הַזֶּה. וְלֹא הֵיטְהָה הַלְכָה שְׁהֵיטְהָה תְלוּיָהּ בְּבֵית הַמְדַרְשָׁא שְׁלֹא פִירְשׁוּהָ. וְאִרְבּוֹן גְּמִלְיָא לֹא מְנַע עֲצָמוּ מִבֵּית הַמְדַרְשָׁא אֲפִילוּ שְׁעָה אַחַת.

It was taught: There is a tradition that tractate *Eduyyot* was taught that day. **And everywhere** in the Mishna or in a *baraita* that they say: **On that day**, it is referring to **that day**. **There was no halakha** whose ruling was pending in the **study hall that they did not explain** and arrive at a practical halakhic conclusion. **And even Rabban Gamliel did not avoid the study hall for even one moment**, as he held no grudge against those who removed him from office and he participated in the halakhic discourse in the study hall as one of the Sages.

דְּתַנּוּ: בּוּ בַּיּוֹם בָּא יְהוּדָה גֵּר עַמּוּנִי לְפָנֵיהֶם בְּבֵית הַמְדַרְשָׁא. אָמַר לָהֶם: מָה אֲנִי לְבֹא בְקִהָל

As we learned in a mishna: **On that day, Yehuda, the Ammonite convert, came before** the students in the study hall **and he said to them: What is my legal status in terms of entering into the congregation** of Israel, i.e., to marry a Jewish woman?

אָמַר לוֹ רַבֵּן גַּמְלִיאֵל: אָסוּר אֲתָה לָבֹא בְּקִהְלָה. אָמַר לוֹ רַבִּי יְהוֹשֻׁעַ:
 מוֹתֵר אֲתָה לָבֹא בְּקִהְלָה. אָמַר לוֹ רַבֵּן גַּמְלִיאֵל: וְהֲלֹא כָּבֵר נֶאֱמַר
 "לֹא יָבֹא עַמּוֹנִי וּמוֹאָבִי בְּקִהְלָה הַזֶּה?" אָמַר לוֹ רַבִּי יְהוֹשֻׁעַ: וְכִי עַמּוֹן
 וּמוֹאָב בְּמִקּוֹמָן הֵן יוֹשְׁבֵינָהּ? כָּבֵר עָלֶיהָ סִנְחָרִיב מֶלֶךְ אַשּׁוּר וּבְלִבְל
 אֵת לְהֵאוּמוֹת, שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר: "וְאָסִיר גְּבֻלוֹת עַמִּים וְעֵתוֹדוֹתֵיהֶם
 שׁוֹשְׁתֵי וְאוֹרִיד כְּבִיר יוֹשְׁבֵימָהּ", וְ לְדַפְרֵישׁ — מְרוּבָא פְרִישׁ.

Rabban Gamliel said to him: You are forbidden to enter into the congregation. Rabbi Yehoshua said to him: You are permitted to enter into the congregation. Rabban Gamliel said to Rabbi Yehoshua: Wasn't it already stated: "An Ammonite and a Moabite shall not enter into the congregation of the Lord; even to the tenth generation shall none of them enter into the congregation of the Lord forever" (Deuteronomy 23:4)? How can you permit him to enter the congregation? Rabbi Yehoshua said to Rabban Gamliel: Do Ammon and Moab reside in their place? Sennacherib already came and, through his policy of population transfer, scrambled all the nations and settled other nations in place of Ammon. Consequently, the current residents of Ammon and Moab are not ethnic Ammonites and Moabites, as it is stated in reference to Sennacherib: "I have removed the bounds of the peoples, and have robbed their treasures, and have brought down as one mighty the inhabitants" (Isaiah 10:13). And although it is conceivable that this particular convert is an ethnic Ammonite, nevertheless, there is no need for concern due to the halakhic principle: Anything that parts from a group parts from the majority, and the assumption is that he is from the majority of nations whose members are permitted to enter the congregation.

אָמַר לוֹ רַבֵּן גַּמְלִיאֵל: וְהֲלֹא כָּבֵר נֶאֱמַר "וְאַחֲרַי כֵּן אָשִׁיב אֶת שְׁבוֹת
 בְּנֵי עַמּוֹן נְאֻם ה' ", וְכָבֵר שָׁבוּ

Rabban Gamliel said to Rabbi Yehoshua: But wasn't it already stated: "But afterward I will bring back the captivity of the children of Ammon, says the Lord" (Jeremiah 49:6) and they have already returned to their land? Therefore, he is an ethnic Ammonite and he may not convert.

אָמַר לוֹ רַבִּי יְהוֹשֻׁעַ: וְהֵלֵא כָּבֵד נֶאֱמַר "וְשָׁבְתִי אֶת שְׁבוֹת עַמִּי
יִשְׂרָאֵל", וְעַדִּיין לֹא שָׁבוּ. מִיַּד הַתִּירוּהוּ לְבֹא בַקָּהָל

Rabbi Yehoshua said to Rabban Gamliel: That is no proof. **Wasn't it already stated** in another prophecy: **"And I will turn the captivity of My people Israel** and they shall build the waste cities, and inhabit them; and they shall plant vineyards, and drink the wine thereof; they shall also make gardens, and eat the fruit of them" (Amos 9:14), **and they have not yet returned?** In rendering the ruling, only proven facts may be taken into consideration. **They immediately permitted him to enter the congregation.**

אָמַר רַבּוֹ גַּמְלִיאֵל: הוֹאִיל וְהָכִי הָוָה, אֵיזִיל וְאַפְיִיסִיָּה לְרַבִּי יְהוֹשֻׁעַ.
כִּי מָטָא לְבֵיתִיהָ, חֲזִינְהוּ לְאַשְׁתָּא דְּבֵיתִיהָ דְּמִשְׁחָרוֹ. אָמַר לִיהָ:
מְכוֹתְלֵי בֵיתְךָ אֶתְּךָ נִיכָר שְׁפָחָמִי אֶתְּךָ

Rabban Gamliel said to himself: **Since this is** the situation, that the people are following Rabbi Yehoshua, apparently he was right. Therefore, it would be appropriate for me to **go and appease Rabbi Yehoshua. When he reached** Rabbi Yehoshua's **house, he saw** that **the walls of his house were black.** Rabban Gamliel **said to** Rabbi Yehoshua in wonderment: **From the walls of your house it is apparent that you are a blacksmith,** as until then he had no idea that Rabbi Yehoshua was forced to engage in that arduous trade in order to make a living.

In-session text:

אָמַר לוֹ: אוּי לוֹ לְדוֹר שְׂאֵתָהּ פְּרָנְסוֹ, שְׂאֵי אֶתְּךָ יוֹדֵעַ בְּצַעְרוֹן שֶׁל תַּלְמִידֵי חֲכָמִים, בְּמָה הֵם
מִתְפָּרְנְסִים וּבְמָה הֵם נִזְוָנִים

Rabbi Yehoshua said to him: Woe unto a generation that you are its leader as you are unaware of the difficulties of Torah scholars, how they make a living and how they feed themselves...